

Speaker Notes

Speaker Summary & Notes

Global Digital Citizenship: Encouraging Safe and Responsible Online Use

Welcome: Brent Olson, Assistant Vice President of Public Policy, AT&T

Brent Olson, former Chairman of FOSI and current Vice Chair, provided the opening welcome on behalf of Natasha Jackson, Chair of FOSI. Olson explained AT&T's commitment to online safety and said he welcomed the opportunity to listen to the lively and informative discussion and take what he learns back to AT&T. He discussed online safety as a global issue that impacts not just France or the US, but the entire world. Olson said that the Internet is without borders and needs to be handled that way.

Welcome: Stephen Balkam, CEO, FOSI

Stephen Balkam welcomed the audience and talked about the work of FOSI, an international non-profit organization with a mission to make the world safer for kids by identifying and promoting best tools, practices, and education methods that also respect free expression. Balkam noted that FOSI brings people together across borders and often brings together fierce competitors. He thanked AT&T for their primary sponsorship and Editions-Profil, Nominum, and France Telecom for also sponsoring the event.

Balkam rhetorically asked, "What do we mean by digital citizenship on a global medium like the Internet." He talked about the history of citizenship tracing its origin to ancient Greece as a collection of rights and responsibilities. Balkam said the goal of increasing online digital citizenship involves developing tools and rules for online safety, increasing media literacy, and researching actual harms as opposed to perceived harms. He noted that there is a greater concern about child-on-child safety issues including sexting and cyberbullying. Balkam talked about the opportunities for developing citizenship in emerging and developed countries especially as broadband is rolled out globally. He noted the growing use of the Internet in Africa, especially through wireless access, and that those who had never had the Internet before now need to be given tools and educational messages to be responsible online. Balkam also stressed the importance of bridging the technology gap between parents and kids. He stressed the importance of fundamental rights in the broadband world including the rights of free expression and privacy and the fundamental right to be safe online. Balkam said that with these rights of citizenship also comes the responsibility to empower kids to be safe online for the positive use of the Internet.

Opening Remarks: Marc Fossier, Executive Vice President & Chief Corporate Social Responsibility Officer, France Telecom

Marc Fossier talked about France Telecom/ Orange efforts not just in France but throughout Europe and in emerging economies. Fossier said that Orange is expanding and recently articulated a social responsibility strategy focused on three keywords: include, preserve, and care. Fossier said the goal is to 'include' – not to leave anyone outside of the group or social range; to 'preserve' - to bring all tools to all customers; and to 'care' - the need to care about the people using the technology. Fossier noted that Orange is active in GSMA, contributes to Teach Today, and has local initiatives through Orange in several countries and is expanding to reach new broadband citizens. Fossier noted the importance of keeping responsible use as key as new technology.

FOSI- An EMEA Perspective – Dave Miles, European Director, FOSI

FOSI's European Director talked about the journey towards "Global Digital Citizenship" and the increasing use of the Internet around the world. Miles remarked on the importance of getting the conditions right for Internet users, many of whom are self-taught digital natives. Miles discussed emerging country markets and the significant steps they are making with the Internet, but also the concerns that can occur with increased access. Miles talked about how telephone and mobile operators are leading the way and bringing a sustainable strategy to Internet development around the globe. Miles also discussed the importance of the 20th anniversary of the UN Bill of Rights for Children and the importance of creating a safe and responsible Internet for kids.

Keynote Speaker – Giuseppe de Martino, Senior Vice President, General Counsel & Head of Public Affairs, Daily Motion

Giuseppe de Martino discussed Daily Motion, the world's largest independent video sharing platform. De Martino explained the global impact of the website, stating that Daily Motion is Paris-based and receives 60 million unique visitors monthly, but less than 15% are French. One billion videos are watched monthly on Daily Motion and it is now one of the top 50 websites worldwide. He stressed that the mission is to provide the best possible experience to users but there are also some challenges because the website grew very quickly in only three years. De Martino believes that video sharing provides more opportunities for people to learn and share positive moments and that it is important to develop good policies to make safety a priority. His key message to people is "Do not be afraid" because the Internet is a wonderful opportunity.

Plenary Panel Discussion - Negotiating a Digital World

Moderator: Ambassador David Gross, Partner, Wiley Rein

Panelists:

- Dorothy Attwood, Senior Vice President, Public Policy and Chief Privacy Officer, AT&T
- Deborah Taylor Tate, 2009 ITU Laureate for Child Online Protection, former Federal Communications Commissioner
- Lars Kindervater, Senior Manager of Public Affairs, Deutsche Telekom
- Isabelle Falque-Pierrotin, Member of the French Council of State & President, Forum des droits sur l'internet

Ambassador David Gross discussed the global phenomenon of the Internet and how even in the economic downturn the growth of international online traffic shows it is relevant more widely than the US and Europe and the traditional Internet. This means that there is growth in the developed world but Internet use is exploding in the rest of the world, especially in African countries and South America. Ambassador Gross discussed the issue of regulation and the FCC's recent inquiry with the Child Safe Viewing Act. He asked the panelists about the role of regulation and where the action will be with online safety in the next one to two years.

Dorothy Attwood explained that in this context there is never a question about government and non government involvement; rather, it is a question of how industry and government can best coordinate. Attwood stressed that AT&T believes it has a responsibility and is uniquely positioned for Internet Safety. Attwood said that AT&T worries about bad contact and bad communication and works to create quality contact and connections. She said that she is not suggesting no government involvement or no regulation, but there needs to be a robust dialogue and the key is coordination and cooperation. Attwood said that over the next two years industry needs to explore how to increase adoption. She noted that a restraint in use of the new platform is fear and concern from people who don't know enough about how to use the Internet and believes that in the US there is availability but not use. Attwood thinks that one of the biggest concerns is reaching at risk youth who may not pay attention to education and tools and may not have families that are engaged in their online behavior. Attwood also talked about AT&T's involvement in the IGF as an example of multi-stakeholder international collaboration.

Deborah Taylor Tate noted that there has been an explosion of development in Internet access. She stated that being involved in child safety issues doesn't mean that you are for regulation. Tate explained that the ITU's website has draft guidelines for industry and parents. She explained that the Chairman of the FCC is bringing attention to this very important issue but may not look into regulation. Tate suggested that the audience read Common Sense Media's last two reports and noted that there is a disparity between what kids do online and what parents think they are doing.

Isabelle Falque-Pierrotin said that in France, child protection is a key issue and they are working to understand how to handle the new risks and challenges. Falque-Pierrotin stressed the need for cooperation between state, industry, and end users. She explained that the culture in France is more state-centered so the government is playing a role in governing these issues. They have started to draft multi-stakeholder agreements on parental controls and created the Internet Rights Forum so government and others can work together and collaborate on action plans. She said that state regulation is not the only answer and must be combined with industry self-regulation and what can be done at an individual level. Falque-Pierrotin explained that the word regulation is used differently in Europe and that it does not mean the government will be directly imposing rules, but that the Internet needs some rules whether they come from industry or government unless the Internet is to become a social jungle. She mentioned that there needs to be increased education and real training. Falque-Pierrotin also suggested that there could be international cooperation and international trade agreements to help set common rules for online safety.

Lars Kindervater talked about the Internet and mobile access and the difficulties of protecting children from inappropriate content in a mobilized world where parents have less control. Kindervater explained that the mobile industry in Europe self regulates and that it is important for industry to have room to compete. Kindervater believes that there is no one solution because services and value systems vary by country and one European code or a global safety standard will not work. He thinks that a model framework for child safety could be created and adapted for local circumstances.

Plenary Panel Discussion – The Online World: What does it mean for Emerging Digital Societies?

Moderator: David Miles, European Director, FOSI

Panelists:

- Dieter Carstensen, Project Manager, Save the Children Denmark
- Maria Jose Cantarino de Frias, Corporate Responsibility Manager, Telefonica
- Nevine Tewfik, Director, Cyber Peace Initiative, Egypt
- Ana Luisa Rotta, European Projects Director, Optenet

Dieter Carstensen talked about the 20th anniversary of the UN Convention on the Right of the Child this year and the need to promote the rights of protection, privacy, empowerment, and participation. Carstensen talked about the number of worldwide online safety initiatives and said it is important to make kids safer. He noted that Internet use by young people in some countries only takes place in public places like Internet cafes but said that the digital divide between developing and developed nations is narrowing. Carstensen said that two years ago the IGF stated that the challenge was to “connect the next billion” but he believes the challenge is not just to connect but to make sure “we connect the next billion safely.”

Maria Jose Cantarino de Frias discussed Telefonica’s work in South America and the use of new technology by kids. She mentioned the growing number of Internet users in Latin America, especially those using mobile telephony. She explained recent research that found that children are very active users of mobile phones and they prefer the Internet to television even if they don’t have the Internet at home. According to Telefonica, in Latin America, 48% of children can access the Internet but few have parental controls and many are accessing the Internet from cyber cafes. She also noted that there is a gender disparity in Internet use in South America. Cantarino de Frias talked about why the numbers for Internet use differs between Spain and Latin America and said that priorities are different and concerns about poverty and child labor are higher than new technology. She also discussed efforts by Per Nino in South America to eradicate child labor.

Ana Luisa Rotta talked about Optenet’s commitment the child protection online since 1997. Optenet is involved in the EU Safer Internet program and many other initiatives in Europe. Optenet supports Protegeles, a Spanish NGO hotline against child sexual abuse images online. These help lines use technologies to help children and parents deal with cyberbullying and pro ana and pro bulimia images. Rotta discussed initiatives that respond to illegal material on the Internet in Latin American countries. She said that hotlines are in contact with each other as well as with law enforcement to help eradicate child sexual abuse from the Internet and help prevent child prostitution. Rotta discussed how the problem of poverty in Latin America leads to child prostitution and how hotlines like Protegeles work with police investigations to help remove the images and eradicate poverty in the region. Rotta and Miles discussed the idea of treating children as a whole in South America and how children are the ones leading the Internet revolution in South America.

Nevine Tewfik discussed the Cyber Peace Initiative in Egypt. She explained that Egypt is a country facing many challenges including literacy, poverty, and health concerns so online safety is not always seen as a priority. Tewfik said that issues of Internet access and penetration are still challenges in Arab countries, in addition to the challenges of digital literacy. Tewfik explained that Africa and Asia will host the next one billion online users, so people need to focus on safety. In Egypt, the Cyber Peace Initiative gives empowerment messages to the community and explains how to use different tools and how to use the Internet safely. The group is working to educate and empower youth through public-private

partnerships. Tewfik said they found a good way to reach young people, namely through their peers, so they started Net Aman, where 11 young people are trained on safety tools and they form care groups to train others. They have also done this by educating parents to train other parents. In Egypt there is now a clear definition of child pornography, which is criminal, and they have a government department now working on cybercrime with the assistance of the Cyber Peace Initiative. They are taking components from more developed digital societies and adapting to the Egyptian culture.

Breakout Session 1 – Targeted Advertising; Understanding How Self-Regulation & Responsible Use can Promote Consumer Empowerment

Moderator: Camille de Stempel, Director of Policy, AOL Europe

Panelists:

- Laure Baëté, Legal Counsel, Forum des Droits sur l'Internet
- Wayne J. Keeley, Director, Children's Advertising Review Unit, Better Business Bureau
- Olivier Esper, Public Policy Manager, Google
- Giuseppe de Martino, Senior Vice President, General Counsel & Head of Public Affairs, Daily Motion

Camille de Stempel of AOL Europe began this breakout discussion by quoting European Commissioner Vivian Redding and talking about how self-regulation can promote consumer empowerment. She said that AOL Europe is trying to come up with good practice principles to see how to build trust and enhance guidelines in different markets. She noted that it is not forbidden to advertise to children, but guidelines create a category specifically for children. De Stempel explained the Interactive Advertising Bureau's self-certification process and said that data protection laws in Europe right now are more robust than ever before. She also stressed the need for consumer education and the development of best practices in the targeted advertising industry.

Laure Baëté discussed how Forum de droits sur l'internet functions as a working group on targeted advertising to come up with good practices. They examine personalized advertising and started working on research in December 2008. She said they found that 20% of people feel personal data is not protected. She shared that there are many concerns shown in a recent study where 54% of people declared themselves suspicious about the use of personal data. Baëté explained findings that targeted advertising has grown with the success of social networks and that consumers are unaware of what is being used about them when they share personal information on social networks. Audience questions created a dialogue about where advertisers are getting information and how segmenting audiences happens offline as well as online. Emma Ashcroft of Yahoo! talked about the different perceptions with online and offline advertising and said that information is traded openly in the offline world but people don't always understand that, and suggested that the focus should be on educating users.

Wayne Keeley of the Children's Advertising Review Unit (CARU) talked about perceptions online and offline and mentioned that one big concern for the online world of targeted advertising is that data can be hacked. Keeley talked about the difference between the US and Europe in terms of regulation in this area. He said that CARU monitors and reports advertisers to the FTC if they don't follow

recommendations. Keeley explained that when it comes to behavioral advertising, the best practices in this field must exclude targeting children because it is very hard to get verifiable consent. He said that CARU has always been involved in discussions about personal identifiable information and that they are looking at best practices to see what other countries are doing. Keeley noted that they are concerned about shared computers and interest-based advertising when multiple family members use one machine.

Olivier Esper of Google said that the trust of Internet users is essential in this area. He said that in order to maintain the trust of users Google announced its “interest-based advertising market.” Google had been focusing on context-based advertising but is now doing interest-based advertising by associating interests with browser cookies in order to maintain the trust of users while still using Google’s online business model. Esper explained that Google focused on control by the user and transparency. He said they were inspired by the FTC in the US and Interactive Advertising Bureau in the UK and developed an ad preference manager that users can access on their browser. Esper explained that this allows users to add, delete, or opt out of the tracking and advertising. He said that Google created a privacy center using more familiar language because few people read Terms of Use. Google includes videos related to privacy and cookies to make practices clear to users.

Giuseppe de Martino said that trust, transparency, and truth are very important elements for the DailyMotion website. He explained that it is a balancing act and he works hard to ensure that they don’t disappoint the advertisers or the users. He also said that it is important to make people understand advertising and that they do want advertisers to continue to invest in the website so that more consumers can share videos. De Martino stated that DailyMotion uses contractual terms and strong commitments to users to govern its advertising policy.

Breakout Session 2 –Social Networking Sites; Friend or Foe to Digital Citizenship?

Moderator: Stephen Balkam, CEO of FOSI

Panelists:

- Alban Ondrejcek, Security Consultant, FT/Orange
- David Wright, e Safety Consultant, South West Grid for Learning
- Lucinda Fell, Policy & Communications Manager, Childnet International
- Richard Allan, Director of Policy EU, Facebook
- Ilya Golenopolsky, Chief Editor, Boodoo.ru

After the morning sessions took a 500 foot view of what the digital world looks like right now and how developing countries are adapting to use emerging technologies safely, Stephen Balkam moderated a panel with representatives from social networking sites and nonprofit groups. The panel looked at the best ways to protect children on the web and the challenges these groups face on a daily basis.

Alban Ondrejcek, a Security Specialist with FT/Orange, shared a video he had made illustrating how social networking sites are a powerful tool to gather people on a particular issue, to make new friends

and re-connect with old ones, and to become famous. But as Ondrejcek explained, a powerful tool needs to be used properly. His short film demonstrated that the danger doesn't come from the tools but from inappropriate use and behaviors, and a lack of knowledge and education in a specific area, in this instance online safety. This provided a perfect platform for the other panelists to then share some of the educational work they were doing in the area of digital citizenship.

Richard Allan explained that Facebook employs the best engineers to keep up with new technologies and said that Facebook was working with a large support staff across the world, as well as local law enforcement and the user community itself, to make the social network site as safe as possible for members. He mentioned the importance of making sure the user community is fully engaged in Facebook's privacy and safety efforts. Allan talked about the importance of users understanding good security and using the tools provided. He said that Facebook responds to feedback and changes its privacy controls when needed. Allan was asked about how Facebook deals with cyberbullying and other challenges. He said that Facebook is built around strong community rules. He said that Facebook does not allow pornography and does not allow harassment. He said they have important Terms of Service and can remove abusers in order to make sure the community does not allow bullying or other abuses of the Terms of Service. Allan said they try to be as open as possible and allow community norms to help the network continue safely and successfully.

David Wright with the South West Grid for Learning (SWGfL), a nonprofit group that provides schools and educational establishments in Southwest England with safe broadband internet connectivity and broadband-enabled learning resources, said they walk a fine line between filtering systems and wanting to expand technology for students, which is difficult when using the Internet as an educational tool. Wright also said that there are signs of schools integrating social networking into schools and using social networking in a controlled environment which can be a positive experience for students.

Ilya Golenopolsky, the newest FOSI Board Member, and first Russian member, is with Boodoo, a new social networking site for children in Russia. He said that parents were often the challenge, as they have different views on what children should and should not have access to, and educating them on the potential problems can be the key challenge. Golenopolsky noted that in countries like Russia, they were still in the phase of convincing parents that the Internet was needed. He stressed that parents would need to be educated about the importance of Internet use for children. Golenopolsky said that Boodoo believes that they can encourage and teach digital citizenship through playing games and working with children, so that skills are developed naturally.

Lucinda Fell of Childnet International talked about the importance of having a dialogue about safety. She noted that Childnet has been discussing digital citizenship since 2007 and works directly with kids, parents, and teachers. Fell said it is important to teach parents and teachers to be good examples online and understand what kids are doing online. Fell said that Childnet has taught more than 20,000 students in the past year and talks about security and responsibility. She also noted Childnet's involvement with the UK Council for Child Internet Safety and an upcoming positive media campaign that the Council was doing, designed to educate and encourage safety online.

After discussing the challenges with social networking sites Balkam asked the panelists if social networking websites were a friend or foe and the majority answer was that sites were a friend because they were a powerful tool to bring people together. It was stressed that companies and organizations have to ensure people used them properly and safely, and were aware of what dangers there were. The

consensus was that education was needed to encourage users to take responsibility and understand the consequences of their actions online. The importance of adults understanding the technology and how kids were using it was also expressed as key.

Breakout Session 3: Key Challenges and Solutions to Help Consumers Choose the Right Technology

Moderator: Marian Merritt, Internet Safety Advocate, Symantec

Panelists:

- Laurie Coffin, Director of Marketing Communications, Blue Coat Systems
- Mark Dampster, Head of Sales & Business Development, StreamShield
- Rik Ferguson, Solutions Architect, Trend Micro
- Antoine Gilles, Product Manager, Editions Profil
- On Kalich, Director of Product Marketing, Flash Networks
- Gary Thomassen, Vice President, Products, RuleSpace LLC

Marian Merritt opened the session by discussing a recently produced booklet on cyber-crime. She told the audience that Symantec was currently carrying out research into what users are doing when they went online. One of the findings showed that children spent twice as much time online than their parents realized. The research also indicated that whilst parents and children might be in contact more than ever before, with e-mail, texting and Instant Messaging, they were not communicating as much and children craved increased communication with their parents.

Another outcome of the research was the realization that children were not typing URLs into their browsers, or using favorites and bookmarks like their parents might have done. Even for popular sites such as You Tube and MySpace, children are accessing them by typing the name of the site into a search engine and following the links from there. Merritt wondered aloud what implications this would have for the domain industry in the future.

On Kalich, from Flash Networks, described how mobile Internet content had evolved from the 'walled garden' originally provided by operators to the full Internet experience we can access on our mobile devices today.

Kalich told the audience that the past two years had seen an explosion of dramatic growth in the use of the Mobile Internet. He told the attendees that 37% of teens aged between 13 and 17 years old in the United States were using the Mobile Internet in some form. The figures in Russia are almost as high, at 30%, and the numbers are growing by almost 50% overall each year. He talked about the recent changes in the industry, with the advent of the Google phone, the iPhone and mobile gaming: all changing the way that we communicate.

Kalich continued to share that the Flash Networks solution was designed to urge parents to take back control, to set limits on what their children do and see. He said that when they have talked to parents they have found that they are very concerned about their children being exposed to or having access to drugs, far more than pornographic content. Parents often want immediate notification of any

inappropriate content and they don't see it as an infringement of free speech. He stated that parents perceived mobile operators as being responsible for providing a safe user experience.

Gary Thomassen from RuleSpace told the audience that RuleSpace categorizes websites and web content to enable the provision of filtering systems. He said that their database contains over 70 million URLs which are categorized by the nature of their content. He admitted that they will never have a definitive list of all sites and do not attempt to achieve that due to the constantly changing nature of the Internet. Ten years ago, RuleSpace supplemented their database with a real-time element to deal with unknown sites and user-generated sites such as Facebook, Twitter and MySpace. This dynamic content can only be filtered or categorized by actually looking at it. Thomassen's company only searches for inappropriate content. They work with partners who use their database for their own products. He concluded by saying that some 200 – 250 million users are protected by the end results of their work.

Mark Dampster from StreamShield (part of the Detica group of companies) advised that his company deals in cyber-security: fraud, crime and other general threats. His job focused on the technology behind the networks for both fixed and mobile solutions. Working on an international level, Mark commented that solutions have to be easy to use as well as cheap – if not free – to the end-user. His view is that if solutions are easy to use or built in to the infrastructure it would be easier for them to be adopted. Currently under debate is whether to build such services into carrier networks. His final comment was that implementing security measures was hard enough in the western world and that far greater challenges lie elsewhere.

Laurie Coffin from Blue Coat Systems introduced herself and told the attendees that her company was a security company which sold both a corporate web filtering system and offered a free consumer version (K9 Web Protection: <http://www1.k9webprotection.com/>), given to parents. On the corporate side they focus on blocking content whereas on a consumer level, it was more about empowering parents and educating them about what their kids are doing online.

Antoine Gilles from Editions Profil told the audience that his company is currently working on a product called Profil Parental Filter 2. It is an intelligent content filtering system which covers not only content of web pages but also links and URLs. Gilles said that the Internet is constantly changing and that his company tries to tell parents to check what their children are doing online. The company is working on a Mobile version for the next release of the product.

Rik Ferguson from Trend Micro was the final panelist to introduce himself. His role involves an outreach element: talking to parents and educators. He said that the Internet is a great place but that users need to know about risks, and that they are not only content-related, such as cyber-bullying and grooming. Ferguson blogs for Trend Micro and looks at online threats as they become known. He told the attendees that Trend Micro has created the Smart Protection Network, a cloud-based system offering dynamic, real-time protection. It looks at e-mails and web destinations, for example URLs and file reputation. Rik said that the volume of malicious software is growing very rapidly and that criminals are using sheer volume to evade pattern-based software.

Marion Merritt then posed the following question to the panel: "We have the tools – where are the gaps?" Ferguson said that it wasn't necessarily a case of lacking the tools as much as lacking awareness (from parents) and focus. Parents don't know, for example, about mobile Internet access. Merritt said that she couldn't see an address bar in most mobile phone browsers so it was easier to fall prey to a

phishing scam for example. Kalich, who felt that technology was good now, agreed with Ferguson about a lack of awareness, that there were some gaps and he suggested that video content was the next challenge. He also felt that mobile App stores were a risk and that more needs to be done to make things safer. His view was that self-regulation was key, providing safer places for users with the content they wanted, but in a safe environment which would make them feel more secure.

Laurie Coffin agreed and asked the question, how do you make parents aware? She made the point that they become advocates when they have a problem, or know someone who has a problem, with the Internet and safety. Gary Thomassen agreed and said that his view was that a lot of people just don't know what to do. If asked, 100% of parents would say that they want to protect their children but only about 1% will have actually put anything in place to try to ensure their safety. He feels that technology covers about 99% of the threats and that free software is available to those who want it but that education is the key to actually making the difference.

Rik Ferguson made the point that companies such as those behind social networks provide a platform-based service to users but that they haven't implemented protection measures and he felt that was something which was sorely missing. Mark Dampster told the attendees that he felt that social networking was more dangerous [than other places people visit] because of the anonymity provided. Ferguson then made the point that of course the PC can be situated in a publicly-used room but that a phone could be used anywhere.

Antoine Gilles stated that cyber-bullying and sexting are two big problems facing users. He said there are issues with filtering sexting because by their very nature they are images. To identify cyber-bullying, all the text in the message needs to be identified: this makes the Mobile Internet a much more difficult place to police, so that technology originally developed for PC use would need adapting. Kalich agreed that the Mobile Internet was very different to PC and that the old set-up was fairly simple: you had PCs and you had Macs. In the mobile space, there are hundreds of different devices which have different manufacturers and operating systems. In his opinion this means that client-based solutions are simply not a possibility and that action must be taken at a network level. He made the point that everything that can be accessed on a PC can also be accessed from a mobile device and sees that video will be the next issue on the Mobile Internet as well.

Thomassen agreed: a home PC can be shared among adults and children but when using a mobile device you have a profile for the owner, who is almost always the sole user. He said that that is what makes network solutions so powerful and client-based solutions less necessary. He said that a problem with network filtering would arise if using an open WiFi network – and many mobile devices have WiFi access built in now. He expresses that there were issues with video, that it was harder than with web classification and that it was not just a case of using an algorithm to scan them. His company is using speech recognition in the form of existing technology to filter. He shared that there was a vast amount of video available online, and that one of the things they could do to make things easier would be to trust the categorization given to files by reputable movie studios and television content producers.

Ferguson commented that if you were to block the Internet, people would try to get round it, leading them to search for other providers. "Black Hat SEO" (Search Engine Optimization) is a risk as users unwittingly download software/information that they thought would keep them safe but which actually exposes them to more risks. His point was that you might be successful in blocking the user from accessing the objectionable content, but that Black Hat was a great risk to the end-user.

Merritt asked what the panelists' companies were doing in the field of education and awareness-raising and Rik Ferguson mentioned Trend Micro's outreach program where they hand out software and encourage people to use the right technology. He mentioned a recent case where a company held all the data that it was collecting on where children were going on the Internet and provided it (at a cost) as raw marketing research data – in effect, spyware posing as a legitimate tool for parents. He reiterated the need to educate parents to keep their children safe but the need to choose the right solution. Some parents will want total visibility but that it will vary by parts of the world and that no one solution will suit everyone.

Merritt talked about the need for solutions to be low-cost, or even free, but made the point that even though there are free solutions available there was not as much take-up as one might think. She asked whether this was a middle-class thing where you would only ever reach really engaged parents? Have parents got more basic concerns in the current economic environment? What are the challenges? Kalich said that mobile operators would have to provide the protection and that it would take time, but that unfortunately in the interim, we would have to hear more horror stories before we won – and that phones are used by everyone. Dampster said that there was an attitude of complacency among parents and that the UK is almost at a tipping point of incurring governmental regulation, and that education, and proof that it was working, was key to avoid this.

Gary Thomassen said that we have seen the example of mandatory filtering in Australia and that it was a disaster. Fergusson cited the Chinese 'Green Dam' project as an example of how this could create a huge problem: if you included a single agent on every PC you create the possibility of exploiting vulnerabilities to create a giant botnet where compromised machines could be used for malicious purposes. Laurie Coffin said that that was why Blue Coat Systems was working with the community, hopefully enabling a system of peer-to-peer education where parents would educate other parents. Gary commented that the issue would never be solved and that there would need to be a constant push. Operators and carriers will continue to offer services but when he bought his son a cell phone recently he was not once asked about enabling parental controls, even though his son was present and it was clear that the device was for him. Merritt said that she had encountered a very similar experience and that clearly it highlighted a gap.

Merritt closed the session by summing up: there is more to be done on the issues of communication and education is key to that success. If we get parents and kids talking, we may succeed.

Plenary Panel Discussion – Challenges to Privacy in the Online World and Beyond

Moderator: Jim Halpert, Partner, DLA Piper

Panelists:

- Annie Mullins, Global Head of Content Standards, Vodafone
- Gwendal LeGrand, Head, IT Experts Department, Commission Nationale de l'Informatique et des Liberte
- Wayne J. Keeley, Director, Children's Advertising Review Unit, Better Business Bureau
- Tara Taubman, Internet & Privacy Lawyer

Annie Mullins of Vodafone said that the mantra of this year has been “location, location, location” and privacy issues had focused around location-based services and the potential for unauthorized surveillance. Mullins said that there are rules and that the Internet is not a lawless place and that a culture of responsibility exists online.

Tara Taubman agreed that location is a challenge but feels the real challenge is the digital footprint that people leave behind. She believes that people need to teach kids to learn progressively how to be wise digital citizens and that there is an expectation of privacy even in a public place online. Taubman discussed terms of use agreements and concluded that they are difficult to read and understand for most people and the terms may get modified without a user even knowing.

Gwendal LeGrand works for the French data protection authority, CNIL, on a number of topics at the national and European level. He called for more transparency from stakeholders. CNIL will be releasing a paper next year on advertising. In 2009, they issued a social networking opinion piece and recommendations for industry. CNIL concludes that data processed is personal data so they are trying to push for privacy safeguards and transparency by industry stakeholders. LeGrand also talked about data retention periods and said a lot of important stakeholders are reducing retention periods to help with privacy concerns. He discussed social networking and explained that over time newer and better ways to manipulate privacy settings have emerged, and this has helped consumers.

Jim Halpert provided an overview of privacy issues in the US. He noted that states have done a lot on security breach notification and due to concerns about safety on social networking sites some state Attorneys General have come up with proposals to protect kids in the online space. Some of the proposed approaches to deal with online safety and privacy concerns include increasing education, age verification, and possibly expanding COPPA in some states to 17 year olds. Halpert explained recent developments in the state of Maine where legislation trying to raise the age restrictions for verifiable parental consent when a child or teen puts information online. According to Halpert, a number of groups challenged these restrictions on the grounds that the law interfered with a minor’s right to speak, resulting in the Maine Attorney General’s decision not to enforce the new law. After an audience member indicated that privacy concerns are a human rights issue, Halpert agreed on their importance and said that solutions need to be technology neutral.

Wayne Keeley explained the function of the Children’s Advertising Review Unit and said they look at national advertising directed to children under 12 and ensure that the advertising is truthful, accurate, and appropriate. He sees a growing interest on the part of regulators to expand the age limits. Keeley pointed to some research studies about tweens and teens who can’t discern advertising on the Internet and said they are monitoring this issue.

Plenary Panel Discussion - Global Broadband Responsibility

Moderator: Stephen Balkam, CEO, FOSI

Panelists:

- Ricardo Kuri, Subdirector Atencion via Internet, Telmex
- Brent Olson, Assistant Vice President of Public Policy, AT&T
- Tom Tovar, CEO, Nominum

- Michael McKeehan, Director of Internet and Technology Policy, Verizon
- Dr. Rachel O'Connell, Chief Safety Officer, Bebo

For the final session of the day, Stephen Balkam asked panelists to reflect on the topics that were discussed and bring together the themes of the day as well as put some of the ideas into action.

Rachel O'Connell of Bebo commented that the way consumers behave has significantly altered the digital economy. She discussed cyberbullying as an exploitation of vulnerability and said that we need to think about addressing the vulnerability through a holistic approach for young people, including improving mental and social care. She said that young people may get support from the wrong people or have vulnerabilities exploited and that people need to address solutions at a fundamental level as well as look at ways to harness social media. O'Connell explained the work of Digital Britain and expressed that it is important to alter the education system and give young people the skills needed to work in a digital economy. She also talked about "socialnomics" and the importance of having so many users connected with business and the great impact the Internet has on providing a sense of connectedness to the world.

Verizon's Mike McKeehan remarked about the shift in priorities with online safety and thought this was a positive discussion that showed there has been a significant shift from the past where people focused on stranger danger to focusing on what is actually needed for a safe online experience. He noted that different countries have different challenges in different orders and there is no one-size-fits-all solution. He talked about how some countries have concerns with pro anorexia websites and cyberbullying while others are concerned with simply getting their citizens online and needing the Internet for more fundamental reasons. When asked about turning ideas into action, McKeehan said that Verizon really looks to education and tools. He said that Verizon provides a set of parental control tools and cooperate with law enforcement.

Ricardo Kuri of Telmex explained the importance of protecting children online in less developed countries. He said that they have fewer tools and fewer resources and that poverty is a big concern. He talked about corruption problems in Mexico and Stephen Balkam remarked that corruption is the antithesis of citizenship. Ricardo discussed some of the economic hardships in Mexico and concern about a proposed telecom tax and the impact that tax might have on Internet adoption. Kuri called for an increase in education and said there needs to be a focus on tools and greater understanding of the Internet. He discussed the fact that only 25% of Mexican homes have computers but that Telmex is working to provide computers for schools and has given out thousands of computers in the past year that have reached millions of children. The Telmex Foundation is working to bridge the digital divide in Mexico. Kuri also said that they are putting ideas into action by giving out parental controls and antivirus software at no cost and recently launched a hotline in Mexico.

Tom Tovar of Nominum talked about harmonized standards and a need to go beyond privacy into the realm of safety and security for end users. Tovar said it is important to talk about rights and responsibilities online. Tovar discussed a new phase in the Internet and believes it is now more collaborative than ever. He said there would be more government activism and more visionary thinking on the part of government agencies in the future and that it is important to ensure that a user's experience online is relevant.

Brent Olson remarked on the way in which the day had covered online safety in a broader context than previous FOSI conferences through discussions about societal and privacy issues and emerging markets. Olson talked about the remedies that were suggested throughout the day including transparency and giving more control to users. He concluded that the most important thing to do is empower people and get tools to them. Olson discussed the Broadband Technology Opportunity Program being run through the U.S. Department of Commerce and explained that there is still a question of broadband adoption. He noted that research from Pew found that one reason for people not adopting broadband is that they don't believe it is relevant. Olson questioned what that means and said there is a need for more research and for more adoption programs to make broadband relevant for everyone. Dorothy Attwood of AT&T remarked from the audience that the Obama Administration recognizes broadband as a catalyst for literacy and citizenship online and that the Internet can be transformative for governance and it is important to promote online literacy. Olson also talked about the blending of communities that has occurred online and that linking education with Internet use is so important because it leads to empowerment. He thought the government could help with online safety by funding education and using the bully pulpit to emphasize its importance.

Concluding Remarks: Stephen Balkam, CEO, FOSI

Stephen Balkam concluded the day by discussing the importance of digital literacy and teaching kids about critical thinking and making wise choices online. Balkam said that education was key as broadband is rolled out to the next one billion users. He said that it was important to teach people to use this technology in a safe, responsible, and ethical way. Balkam pointed to the IGF as an example of bringing stakeholders together to examine these issues in a broad context. He said that there is no silver bullet and no one single sector that can solve online safety issues or promote global digital citizenship alone. Balkam stressed the importance of building a culture of responsibility and not using the Chinese approach to the Internet. He said that industry was providing the tools and everyone needed to work together to build resiliency within children to encourage them to make wise choices online about how they conduct themselves on the Internet. Balkam said that online safety had moved away from the fear-based approach and needs to continue to evolve to focus on global digital citizenship. Balkam mentioned that these ideas would continue to be discussed at FOSI's Annual Conference on November 4th and 5th in Washington, D.C